Scottish research into the lessons for rural areas from place-based policies

Jane Atterton
(and Andrew Copus and Ruth Wilson, James Hutton Institute)

Rural England Meeting, November 2018
Work Package 3.4 Communities and Wellbeing

Contains four Research Deliverables (RDs)

- RD 3.4.1: Demographic change in remote areas
- RD 3.4.2: Place-based policy and its implications for policy and service delivery
- RD 3.4.3: Rural landscape and community wellbeing
- RD 3.4.4: Local assets, local decisions and community resilience

https://www2.gov.scot/Topics/Research/About/EBAR/StrategicResearch/strategicresearch2016-21/srp2016-21
Demographic Change in Remote Areas

Key research question:

What are the links between trends in farming/crofting/key rural industries and population change, and how do these affect the provision of ecosystem services, and threaten the resilience of rural communities?
The project

Changes in crofting/farming
Changes in other land-based activities
Demographic change
Provision of ecosystem services
Restructuring and diversification of local economy
Changing "framework conditions" (peripherality, lifestyles etc)
Policy, austerity...
Provision of Services of General Interest
Remote Rural Area
Agricultural Policy
Rural Development Policy
Environment Policy
Local Governance
National Econ. Policy
Endogenous Dev. Capacity

O1 Demographic Change
O2 Agric and Rural Industries
O3 Land Use, Natural Assets, ES
O4 Services of General Interest
O5 Endogenous Dev. Capacity
How we defined the Scottish SPA

Scottish Sparsely Populated Areas (SPA)

• Output areas from which less than 10,000 people can be reached within 30 minutes travel using roads and ferries
  • 48.7% of the area of Scotland
  • Population 135,000
  • 2.6% of Scotland’s population
  • Divided into 6 sub-regions
  • N.B. large parts of the Highlands and Islands outside SPA
The Recent Demographic Narrative

- Long term decline throughout 20th century
- Brief reversal during early “noughties”
- Shrinkage resumed around 2008
- Non-SPA rural and urban have consistently positive trends
The future...

- NRS publish projections for Council Areas and SCAP areas
- PopGroup software uses a 1 year cohort model – small numbers in small areas...
- Therefore developed 5 year cohort model for small areas...
- “Business as usual” migration assumptions
- Finding: Total SPA population predicted to shrink by 25% by 2046
Age Structure

Shrinkage most rapid in the working age population (-33%)
0-14 declined by about -20%
65+ shrinks by 18%
Dependency rates rising throughout SPA
Western Isles most severe shrinkage
N Isles least affected
Recent migration legacy a key driver

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Percentage Change 2011-2046</th>
<th>Dependency Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0-14</td>
<td>15-64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northern Isles</td>
<td>-19</td>
<td>-26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Isles</td>
<td>-21</td>
<td>-36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NW Highlands</td>
<td>-21</td>
<td>-35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SE Highlands</td>
<td>-21</td>
<td>-31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Argyll and Bute</td>
<td>-18</td>
<td>-34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southern Uplands</td>
<td>-9</td>
<td>-35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Scottish SPA</strong></td>
<td>-19</td>
<td>-33</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Can we do anything?

- Mitigation or adaptation? Rewilding or Repopulation?
- Populations change slowly – generational legacy effects
- Fertility and mortality rates cannot easily be changed
- Migration is the only lever...
- How much do we need? Is this realistic?
- Well-being/quality of life in the SPA will determine rates of migration
- Service provision is a key element of well-being
- Access to education in/from the SPA could have a significant impact on future population trends in the SPA

### Annual net migration required to stabilise population at 2011 level...

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Northern Isles</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Isles</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>157</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NW Highlands</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>151</td>
<td>374</td>
<td>333</td>
<td>304</td>
<td>333</td>
<td>335</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SE Highlands</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>184</td>
<td>158</td>
<td>147</td>
<td>161</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Argyll and Bute</td>
<td>159</td>
<td>189</td>
<td>445</td>
<td>357</td>
<td>308</td>
<td>308</td>
<td>276</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southern Uplands</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Scottish SPA</strong></td>
<td><strong>432</strong></td>
<td><strong>553</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,348</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,137</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,005</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,058</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,021</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Service provision: Sparsely Populated Areas

- Childcare
- Education
- Health
- Care homes

2007 = 100
Care for Older People: Analysis

Number of care homes

Capacity of care homes

Data source: Care Inspectorate
SGIs and Demographic Change in Remote Areas

Population decline
- Out migration
  - Reduced community capacity
  - Reduced SGI provision
  - Reduced ‘liveability’

In migration
- Population stability or growth
  - Increased community capacity
  - Improved SGI provision
  - Improved ‘liveability’

OR

Reduced SGI provision
Increased community capacity

How can we activate and nurture virtuous cycles of improvement in remote areas?
Place-based policy and its implications for policy and service delivery

Key research question: Can place-based policies address differences in economic performance and social outcomes in Scotland’s rural areas and small towns?
The Project

O1 Map the policy and service delivery landscape
O1.1 Review of place-based and ‘spatially blind’ policies
O1.2 Summary matrix of the policy landscape in Scotland
O1.3 Review and mapping of the service delivery landscape

O2 Understand small town/rural linkages
O2.1 Review of rural-small-town-urban classifications
O2.2 Review theories/models of rural-small-town-urban linkages
O2.3 Review of rural-urban typologies

O3 Measure & map socio-economic outcomes
O3.1 Assess availability of data sources for relevant geographies
O3.2 Assess suitability of data and measures (fit-for-purpose)
O3.3 Map outcome measures for inclusive growth

O4 Case study work
O4.1 Develop sampling framework based on findings from O3
O4.2 Case study work (up to 10 case studies) with local actors: Interdependencies; drivers of growth; lived experience locally

O5 Thematic and statistical analysis
O5.1 Econometric modelling of rural-small-town-urban linkages
O5.2 Analysis of the effects of national and local level policies (O1)
O5.3 Typology for policy and service delivery intervention (O2)

O6 Reporting
O6.1 Synthesise findings thematically throughout programme (O1-O5)
O6.2 Make recommendations for policy interventions across areas
The background

- Evidence of rural diversity
- Evidence of persistent (and growing) socioeconomic inequalities
- Rural-urban flows/interactions
What is place-based policy? What are the implications for rural areas?

**What is place-based policy?**
- OECD New Rural Paradigm and Rural Policy 3.0
- EC (Barca report – contrast to Sapir Report)
- Public service reform agenda in Scotland

**What are the implications for rural?**
- Specific rural service delivery challenges
- Scale of place
- Evidence base
- Varied community capacity to engage
- Chance to demonstrate rural opportunities not just challenges and needs

---

1. Place-based policy approaches and rural Scotland

   Jane Atterton
   Rural Policy Centre, SRUC (Scotland’s Rural College)
   March 2017

---

1. This paper was funded by the Rural and Environment Science and Analytical Services Division of the Scottish Government. It has been written as part of joint work undertaken by SRUC and the James Hutton Institute in Research Deliverables 3.4.1: Place-based policy and its implications for policy and service delivery (in Work Package 3.4 Committees and Wellbeing) of the Scottish Government Rural Affairs and Environment Portfolio. Scottish Research Programme 2014-21.

2. Dr Jane Atterton is Researcher and Policy Researcher in SRUC’s Rural Policy Centre and leads the delivery of Research Deliverable 3.4.2 on place-based policy and service delivery for which this paper is a deliverable. For more information, please contact Jane (jane.atterton@rural.scot).
But... what exactly is place-based policy?

- Spatially blind v place-based approaches
- SRDP and rural mainstreaming
- Bottom-up community development and Community Planning Partnerships (‘territorial governance’)
- Need to better link the two
- What evidence-base is required?
Key principles for future rural policy in Scotland

• A more positive narrative
• A networked approach
• Need for an accurate, up-to-date evidence base
• An integrated approach
• Rethinking the value of rural proofing
• Taking a place-based approach to policy
• Strengthening rural communities
• Recognising the diversity and breadth of activities in rural Scotland
• Placing rural at the forefront of opportunities and challenges
• Acknowledging and strengthening rural-town-urban linkages
Acknowledgements

Scottish Government Rural Affairs and the Environment Portfolio Strategic Research Programme 2016-2021

Research Deliverable 3.4.1 Demographic change in remote areas

Research Deliverable 3.4.2 Place-based policy and its implications for policy and service delivery